

Muslim Women Career Advancement: A Study of Indonesian Public Service

Ilhaamie binti Abdul Ghani Azmi (PhD)

Sharifah Hayati Syed Ismail (PhD)

Siti Arni Basir (PhD)

Academy of Islamic Studies

Universiti Malaya

Malaysia

Abstract

Although Islam demands women to give priority on their families instead of their career, Muslim women have evidenced great achievement in their career and professional life. This article tries to study the facilitators and barriers of Muslim women's career advancement in Indonesian civil service. Using survey that was developed based on past literature, 33 usable questionnaires were analyzed which amounted to 22.45% rate of response. The questionnaires were distributed to three ministries in Jakarta, West Java and three ministries in Aceh, Sumatera by using convenience sampling technique. The study found that there are lots of facilities provided by the Indonesian public service to the Muslim women public servant in order to ease the consequences of working on their families such as child care, job sharing, flexible hours, longer maternity leave and working from home. On top of that, policies available that support the women are treating them with the same trust and confidence, giving them the same assignment, paying them comparable salaries as men and not to relocate them for the sake of career advancement. Furthermore, the factors that contribute to their career success were experience, education, seniority, interpersonal skills, ability in tackling superiors, commitment and dedication, support from superiors, colleagues and family and leadership styles. On the other hand, there are some factors that hinder Muslim women from career advancement which are preference for family, limited access to professional training, personality, lack of leadership charisma, confidence, qualification power; prestigious developmental assignments and informal network, society expectation, gender bias, no mentoring system, low self esteem and not taken seriously. Thus, gender is not a factor of impediment towards career advancement but capabilities and characters are. The Indonesian public service has taken all measures to ensure that Muslim women are equally represented in decision making levels especially in terms of policies and facilities. Furthermore, the respondents show positive attitude toward their career advancement even though they admitted that they are facing some barriers that could hinder their career progression.

Keywords: career advancement, facilitators, barriers, women, public service, Muslim, Indonesia

1. Introduction

Women involvement in public service is evidenced. Their involvement in support and management level is attributed by the education and knowledge they acquired from higher education institutions. Women have also evidenced remarkable achievement in their career advancement.

There are many facilitators that support women in their effort to advance in their career. Newman (1993) has identified advanced education, continuous full time employment, ability, hard work, professional contacts and luck as the facilitators of career advancement. According to Peus and Traut-Mattausch (2008), support in the personal domain included parents, husbands/partners, and children would help women to advance in their career. Meanwhile, Metz (2004) stated that women with children, need to have domestic help and help with dependants in order to obtain career advancement. However, at the same time, there are many barriers that hinder women career advancement such as lack of skills for example, people and communication skills and lack of support of the right people (Olson & Pringle, 2004). Other barrier is the women's low confidence (Oplatka, 2006). Tlaiss and Kausar (2010) indicated that men find it difficult to accept female managers as equals. This has led to other problems such as lack of training, lack of performance appraisal, lower salaries and lack of promotion for women.

Although Islam does not prohibit Muslim women from being active in social and professional arena, Islam demands women to give priority on their families instead of their career. This principle sparks the idea that Muslim women confront significant challenges in their endeavor to advance in their career.

Hence, this article tries to investigate the notion of career advancement of Muslim women in Indonesian public service particularly the facilitators and barriers and their attitude towards career advancement. Indonesia contains the fourth highest number of Muslim population in the world. In order to achieve this research objective, this article is divided further into six sections which are introduction, literature review, methodology, findings, conclusions and implications and limitations.

2. Literature Review

This section will explain definition, facilitators and barriers concepts of career advancement. It also explains about the background of Indonesia, career advancement of Muslim women in Indonesia and its concepts from Islamic perspective.

2.1 Definition of Career Advancement

Dries (2011) defined the meaning of career advancement for female managers into many categories i.e. accomplishment, achievement, enjoyment, integrity, balance, personal recognition, influence, position, reward, relationship, material success, contribution, and freedom. In fact, career advancement is the objective measurement of being successful in one's own work as a result of human capital, socio-psychological and systemic factors (Ilhaamie, Sharifah Hayaati & Siti Arni, 2012).

2.2 Facilitators of Career Advancement

2.2.1 Personal

Kanter (1977) stressed that women perceived the need to work harder and outperform their male colleagues in order to succeed. Meanwhile, Newman (1993) had identified advanced education, continuous full time employment, ability, hard work, professional contacts and luck as the facilitators of career advancement in diminishing order. According to Keeton (1996), women career success factors are education, competence on job, intelligence, self-confidence (human capital), interpersonal skills, hard work and motivation (socio-psychological). Metz (2003) asserted that women's advancement is chiefly related to their knowledge and skills. Olson and Pringle (2004) highlighted on creativity, risk taking, self confidence, able to make decisions and think strategically, possess people skills and being politically astute. Broadbridge (2008) too suggested that determination, attitude to work, ability, work ethic, performance, experiences and interpersonal skills are pre-conditions for women career advancement.

Dreher and Ash (1990) stressed on having the opportunity to display talent and competence to senior management and to acquire information through informal network as the facilitators. Historically, women have been excluded from the networks and work experiences that would provide them access to advancement opportunities. To compensate to this lack of access, women may concentrate on demonstrating their competence and exceptional performance. Meanwhile, Hopkins et al. (2006) found that women career advancement overwhelmingly relate to competence. They too indicated that obtaining challenging and high profile assignments is the most important individual strategy for advancement results in providing women both experience and exposure. This is agreed by Broadbridge (2008) who found that being offered and having access to high-profile assignments is pre-requisite for women career advancement.

On the other hand, Vert (1985) asserted that spouse support is very important in facilitating women's career advancement. However, mobility, according to Lewis (1992), is the real factor in advancement. This is especially important as married women find hard to travel for the sake of their work assignment due to childcare. Contrarily, Naff and Thomas (1994) stated that postponing marriage or remain childless could help women to advance in their careers. Meanwhile, Metz (2004) stressed that women with children need to have domestic help and help with dependants in order their career advancement. Ismail and Ibrahim (2008) found that most women rated their family commitment very high that it is hard for them to achieve balance in work life; hence requiring them to reduce their time for their career.

Women also found it difficult to manage their time due to family and societal structures that place domestic role responsibilities on women's shoulders. According to Peus and Traut-Mattausch (2008), balancing a managerial career with the demands of a family is still very difficult for women.

The authors further suggested that support in the personal domain included parents, husbands/partners, and children would help women to advance in their career.

2.2.2 Organization

According to Hojgaard (2002), facilities and working condition such as maternity leave, easier access to extended leave, child leave and flexible working time are some of the family friendly policies issued by the public sector in order to facilitate women to work in their sector. The equal pay, civil right and anti-discrimination acts also facilitate women to work and advance in their career. Formal support is a basic pre-requisite if organisations are interested in increasing female participation in management and administrative roles (Sandhu & Mehta, 2007). A change in organizations' policies can help women to shatter attitudinal glass ceiling that they encounter throughout their careers (Sandhu & Mehta, 2007). Therefore, organizations should formulate policies that support career advancement for women. Burke et al. (2006), Broadbridge (2008) and Arokiasamy et al. (2011) suggested organizational policies that enclose the following criteria i.e. top management support and commitment, the explicit used of gender in decision making and recruitment, career planning and employee development, the provision of rewards for providing the required support and achieving agreed upon goals for women's advancement, flexibility in work and better promotional structure.

However, according to Naff (1995), having male mentors facilitate women to advance in their careers. This is due to male mentors seemed to hold more powerful positions in the organization. Ehrich (1995) find that mentorship was described as a helpful and powerful career strategy which greatly assists the career development and career mobility of professionals. It was illustrated that access to mentor is synonymous with access to organisational power. Professional mentorship is the most appropriate policy style for women educators to help them break through the glass ceiling. The author added that it was established that mentoring can yield both career developmental outcomes such as salary increases and promotion as well as psycho-social supportive functions like counselling and friendship. Headlam-Wells (2004) stated the benefits accrued from mentor program are career development, new perspectives, networking skills and personal development. Hopkins et al. (2006) indicated that women recognised that having mentors as a strategy for their advancement. Women historically have lacked access to the power structures in organisations, which are usually male in composition. Their experience may tell them that connections to this power structure and to the decision makers will enhance their position in organisations. Ezzedeen and Ritchey (2009) in their study stated that women executives highlighted the importance of support networks within the organization and in the industry or profession in general to stimulate their career achievement. Mentoring was cited as especially important for women career advancement.

In conjunction to this, Burke et al. (2006) suggested that women describing more supportive organizational practices indicated more job and career satisfaction and higher levels of psychological well-being. Burke, Konyucu and Fiksenbaum (2006) found that women who reported more supportive organizational experiences were more engaged in their work and were more job and career satisfied. These show that having organizational support in women's career advancement is important in obtaining higher performance.

2.3 Barriers of Career Advancement

According to Newman (1994), there are three types of barrier variables: human capital, socio-psychological and systemic barriers. The author explained that human capital barriers are identified as insufficient education, domestic constraints, limited financial resources and insufficient experience. Meanwhile, social psychological barriers include sex-role stereotypes/role prejudice, negative perception of women's capacity for managing, questionable motivation and limiting self concepts. Finally, systemic barriers manifest themselves as sex segregation in the labour force, differential career ladder opportunities, sex segregation of domestic labour, limited access to professional training and informal network, lack of mentors; power and female role models, sexual harassment, and perceived lack of compatibility.

Women tend to view their work as secondary to their family livelihoods when compared with men (Vertz, 1985). There are some supportable and complex reasons for women's absence from senior management such as taking their time out for raising children, lack of mobility and social problems (Brenner, Tomkiewicz & Schein, 1989). Human capital theory and exchange theory suggest that married person will be less likely to move for his or her own career advancement.

Married women with considerably lower incomes than their husbands should be especially unlikely to move (Newman, 1993). Women have traditionally lacked acknowledged power within organizations.

If women lack power in organizations because they lack adequate or relevant experience, it is equally true that they lack experience because they are denied the power to define their particular experience as relevant. Thus, gender acts as a barrier to women due to a perceived or real lack of compatibility (Newman, 1993). Even when a working woman had domestic assistance, she is still held responsible for managing her family. If her child or husband is ill, she is expected to interrupt her work in order to ensure that their needs are met. If she fails to do so, society tends to judge her as bad wife or mother. In most cultures, women are expected to be submissive, passive and demure (Corner, 1997). Furthermore, women are assigned jobs with lower prestige than men even within the same job categories. This is due to men are providers and women are carers (Hojgaard, 2002).

Other factors that hinder women from the top are due to their lack of skills such as people skills and communication skills like the ability to read nonverbal cues in dealing with other people and respect for people. They also face problems in getting the right people around them and getting the support of the right people (Olson & Pringle, 2004). Other factor is the women's low confidence. They are given the titles but not the power of authority e.g. Pakistan. In short, they are not as authoritarian as men (Oplatka, 2006). Women had also been facing prejudice from male, but this barrier can be overcome with hard work and persistence (Omair, 2010). Concurring to this, Tlaiss and Kauser (2010) indicated that men find it difficult to accept female managers as equals. This has led to other problems such as lack of training, lack of performance appraisal, lower salaries and lack of promotion for women.

Newman (1983) identified two broad categories of labour-market segregation which are: (a) horizontal segregation, i.e. when different types of work are allocated to men and women (horizontal segregation broadly corresponds to occupational segregation); and (b) vertical segregation, when men and women both participate in various fields of work but women are disproportionately concentrated in the lower grades and men in the higher. Bergmann (1986:114) contended that a "segregation code" prohibits mixing the sexes as equals and reserves upper-level jobs for men. Indeed, public agencies and federal-contract holders tend to be less sex segregated than the private sector and non-contractors.

Meanwhile, Morrison and colleagues described glass ceiling as a "transparent barrier that keeps women from rising above a certain level in corporations" (1987: 13). Other author like Mani (1997) defined glass ceiling as an invisible barrier based on attitudinal or organizational bias which prevents qualified individuals from advancing to managerial positions. According to Oijala (1987), the idea was first introduced in the Wall Street Journal that women climbing the corporate ladder find the going was demanding but possible on the lower rungs of management, however; then hit their heads against an invisible glass ceiling when trying to scale past the middle management level. On the other hand, the U.S. Department of Labour defined the glass ceiling as "those artificial barriers based on attitudinal or organizational bias that prevent qualified individuals from advancing upward in their organization" (1991: 1). Powell and Butterfield (1994) considered glass ceiling as a barrier for women as a group, barring individuals' advancement simply because they are women rather than because they lack the ability to handle jobs at higher levels. The authors explained further that glass ceiling could exist at different levels in different organizations or industries and the term is typically used to suggest a barrier to entry into top-level management positions.

2.4 Indonesia

2.4.1: Background Information

Indonesia is located next to Malaysia and Singapore. Indonesia is the fourth largest of Muslim population in the world. It has at least 200 ethnic groups with four main ethnics which are Javanese (45%), Sudanese (14%), Madurese (7.5%) and Coastal Malays (7.5%). The Indonesians are majority Muslims (87%), Protestants (6%), Roman Catholics (3%), Hindus (2%) and Buddhist (1%). Agriculture is the main labor force in Indonesia (45%) and this follows by services (39%) and industry (16%). The vast majority of the population is employed in micro or small enterprises (90% of off-farm employment). The official language is Indonesian, however; the most prevalent local language is Javanese (Levinson, 1998). Indonesia state is a state based on Pancasila ideology which contains five principles: belief in one supreme God or monotheism, a just and civilized humanity, the unity of Indonesia, democracy, consensus arising out of deliberations amongst representatives and social justice for all people of Indonesia.

A significant feature of Indonesia's governance can be observed in Laws 22/25 of 1999 and 32/33 of 2004, which outlined responsibilities and powers to the *Kota/kabupaten* level of government, equivalent to cities and districts (called regencies in Indonesia). Civil servants are directly responsible to the heads of local government, as opposed to national Ministries. In the initial Decentralization Law 22/25 of 1999, provinces were given very little powers with devolution going directly to the lower branches of government. Under the Revised Law No. 32/33 of 2004, provinces have increased powers of oversight and coordination over local governments.

2.4.2 General Overview of Women Employment in Indonesia

In the 2000s, the female Labour Participation Rate (LPR) fell and the male rate increased. In 2008, it was moderate, whereas the male rate of 85 percent was high. About 39 percent of all employed worked in agriculture, 13 percent in manufacturing, and 48 percent in services, with the female shares being 40 percent, 14 percent and 46 percent respectively. In terms of formal and informal employment at labour market structure, research showed that slightly over 30 percent of all employed and less than 28 percent of females are currently working in the formal sector. About 42 percent of the total labour force and 32 percent of the females are self-employed (Maarten van Klaveren and Kea Tijdens et.al, 2010).

By the year of 2008, the Indonesian work force totalled up to 111.5 million whereby it had a lower female work force participation rate than its neighbouring countries (45%). At that time, the unemployment rate of Indonesia was 8.4 percent, compared to 3.3 percent of Malaysia. At the moment, the unemployment rate for women is higher (7.54%) than men (5.68%) showing that there is gender inequality in the labour force (Asima, 1998). To add things worse, women basically receive lower wages than men for certain basic business and technical skills. Despite gaps in income between sexes in both the formal and informal sectors, and inadequate input and support for training and skills development, women contribute significantly to the growth of agricultural and rural-sector development (UNDP, 2009). Besides that, they are willing to be paid lesser wages than their male counterparts in manufacturing and agricultural sector (Tjijtoherijanto, 1997).

In 2008, 18 million women or 48 percent of the Indonesian female labour force worked in the service sector, broadly defined, from transport and communications to the civil service and services in private households; this was the case for 46 percent of all females in the labour force and a larger share, 49 percent, of all male employed. As for single industries, the shares of those in wholesale and trade (17% of all employed, 22% of all females employed and 14% of all males) were large in international perspective. By contrast, the shares of both women and men employed in finance, public administration, education, and health and social work were relatively small (UN MDG Indicators). Research done by Maarten van Klaveren, Kea Tijdens et.al (2010) calculated this share for the year of 2008 at 31.1 percent.

The percentage of Indonesian women in management was 6.6% in 1985 and this was the lowest in the ASEAN region. The number later increased to 17 percent. On the other hand, only 3.7 percent hold the senior positions in the state enterprises including state banks. This data show that women managers are more likely to be in public than the private sector (Bennington & Habir, 2003). The general reason identified for the situation is due to the illiteracy rate among women (63%) which is higher than men (29%). However, at the higher education level (both state and private universities), girls comprise 47.6 percent of students. This statistics demonstrate that women are attaining relatively equal level of education to men. Furthermore, this also points to a bright future whereby the women's participation in the labour force especially the public service could be increased (UNDP, 2010).

2.4.3 Career Advancement of Women in Indonesian Public Service

There was a rapid growth in the number of temporary officials employed by regional governments over the 1970s and early 1980s. Since then, it has been the strategy to reduce the number of civil servants in general administrative positions, especially those with low levels of education (Booth 2005). Between 1997 and 2008, the size of the civil service has been slimmed down with 490,000 temporary employees or 12 percent. In this process, the female employment share, with 22 percent already small, has been decreased to just over 20 percent (Maarten van Klaveren, Kea Tijdens et.al 2010): whereas the number of males in 2000 to 2008 fell with 11 percent, that of their female colleagues declined by 15 percent (Booth 2005; ILO Laborsta). The women civil servants differ from the male colleagues in several aspects: they are younger, more likely to be single, and are more highly educated.

Meanwhile, Indonesia's civil service consists of some 4.6 million people.

Of this, about 600,000 are police and military, leaving some 4 million civilians as the civil servants at about 2 per cent of the total population, this is small compared to Indonesia's South East Asian neighbours (World Bank, Mac 2000). In 2008, about 2.5 million are employed in public administration and defence and over 40 percent were school teachers or health workers such as nurses.

From 1974 to 1984, the number of women participated in public service increases from 18 percent to nearly 30 percent. Later, it increased to 37.4 percent but only 5.5 percent are in positions of authority. Then, it increased to 7 percent and 11 percent in 1984 (Bennington & Habir, 2003) especially for the echelon 1 officials (Schech and Mustafa 2010).

The Indonesian civil service tends to be a lifetime career, from graduation until retirement (at the age of 56 years old). Thus, civil servants rarely quit or get fired, and seldom move from one ministry to another. If an employee's performance is deemed satisfactory, their grade will advance once every four years. Rises in grade do not, however; guarantee promotions to better managerial positions.

Indonesian government rankings are complicated, being a mix of "*Golongan*" (entry levels based on education) and echelon (structural positions, the top three of which are managerial). There are four *golongan* in ascending order, I-IV, and five echelons in descending order, V-I whereby I being the highest one. One should be in *golongan* III or IV to have a chance of entering structural level of five echelons (Wright & Tellie, 1993).

In 1974, most women were employed in the lowest of the four broad official classifications (*Golongan* I), in which only require elementary-school qualification. By 1984, the majority were found in *Golongan* II, which requires a college degree or equivalent. Women at *Golongan* III (postgraduate degree) had more than tripled from the 1974 level. This indicates progress has been made, although the progress into managerial ranks cannot be ascertained (Wright & Tellie, 1993).

Research in 1992 also showed the same result that women still were underrepresented in the higher ranks of the Civil Service. In 1992, Indonesia had almost 4 million civil servants, of which 35 percent were women but only 12.9 percent of them in the highest ranking out of 519,372 total number of civil servants (Nisha, 1996).

However, according to Sen (1998), women's participation has grown rapidly, doubling in the decade to 1984 and most rapidly in the middle management levels. Women also hold almost 40 percent of *Golongan* II and 32 percent of *Golongan* III positions, although there was only about 13 percent each on the top and bottom levels of the bureaucracy.

Indonesian women also make up less than 1 percent of officials with decision-making authority in local government offices. However, in 2005, for the first time, a woman was appointed as Indonesia's Minister of Finance. This is a contrast to the principal of Islam as Islam should not be a barrier to women's advancement in Indonesia and Muslim women could pursue an academic or professional career after marriage. Thus, women are not restricted to private life but instead should have more access to professional career.

This is due to Indonesian women's performance at work that is proven by T.O. Ihromi (1995) as being dedicated. Indeed, demand for women workers is increasing in Indonesia due to the societal acceptance for women to work and their better education.

Promotions in local government are determined by all civil servants to undergo a standard performance assessment which is known as DP3 every year. This procedure was created during the Suharto regime and emphasizes, among other things, loyalty to Pancasila (the official ideology of the state) and the Constitution (Paramita, 2007).

The Ministry of Finance (MOF) allows women to seek re-assignment to accompany their husbands when they are assigned to another city. While this suggests flexibility towards women's careers, the 'beneficiaries' must accept demotion to a sub-managerial level in their new posting. This flexibility is not offered to men, which means that it is invariably the women are required to accept demotion in order to accompany their husbands (Paramita, 2007).

Indonesian women tend to turn down promotions which are attached to remote postings, preferring to stay in Jakarta, or at least Java. Since they cannot be promoted without serving in remote areas, their grades advance but their positions remain low. The result is that the Jakarta office is filled with women in advanced grades but low positions. It is assumed that they are not their family's main breadwinner and therefore, they are less in need of unofficial payments. However, this could restrict their future careers. It is found out that majority of women who are promoted are widowed or divorced as they can be relocated throughout Indonesia.

This shows that it remains difficult for women with families to advance. On the other hand, women seek to be reassigned to accompany their husbands when they are assigned to another city (Paramita, 2007).

In five ministries i.e. Communication and Information, Transportation, Public Works, Marine and Fisheries, and Religious Affairs, there are no women working in the first echelon (Paramita, 2007). At the second echelon of these ministries, the percentage of women holding the posts ranges from 5.9 percent and 27 percent, and in the third echelon, the percentage ranges from 14.3 percent to 21.2 percent. There are no women working in the first echelon in the state ministries and ministry-level agencies in Indonesia. The percentage of women working in the second echelon ranges from 4.2 to 23.3 percent (UNDP, 2010).

Please refer to table 1 for overall details.

Table 1: Women in the Civil Service by Echelon (2009)

Rank	Women (%)	Men (%)
First Echelons	8.72	91.28
Second Echelons	44.98	55.02
Third Echelons	46.78	53.22
Fourth Echelons	48.07	51.93

Source: UNDP, 2010

To make things worse, these women public servants are subjected to a non-government organisation which is known as Dharmawanita which is compulsory for all women civil servants and civil servants' wives. Nationally, the wife of a senior Minister heads Dharmawanita and thus, the wives in the Dharmawanita hierarchy are placed in accordance with their husband's position in the department. Hence, women civil servants resent their obligations to Dharmawanita as their bosses' wives put additional demands on them. Thus, some have never participated in any Dharmawanita's activity. However, Indonesian women are lucky as they do not require men to share domestic work as the burden of domestic labour is passed to the rural poor (Sen, 1998).

2.5 Career Advancement of Muslim Women: An Islamic Perspective

Since majority of Indonesian population are Muslim, it becomes very crucial to understand some general ideas on woman at work and career advancement from the Islamic point of view. This understanding has a correlation with Muslim life style and perception besides other factors mentioned earlier in this paper. In Islam, men and women are regarded as equal creation (Surah al-Taubah: 71). The Qur'an, Al-Hujuraat 49:13 is often quoted to support this view that humankind derives from an equal pairing of men and women. "Allah favours not man, or woman, but whoever is the most pious". This had been underlined in the principles of justice (al-adalah), equality (al-musawah) and freedom (al-hurriyah) introduced by Prophet Muhammad (p.b.u.h). Women play several roles at a time i.e. producer of nation's future generations, wife and faithful companion to her husband, mother and educator of her children, manager of household, citizen, worker, employer or manager etc.

Thus, conflict between work and family is common. However, women need to give priority to worship Allah, their selves and family (Surah al-Isra' [17]: 24, Sunan al-Tirmidhi). Thus, there is no discrimination among men and women in terms of career advancement including in giving good service. Indeed, Islam encourages good deeds and development of its *ummah* (nation) in their career making. Islam does not want its people to be backward (Surah an-Nisa: 32). Hence, employers should facilitate their employees' career advancement in terms of providing related developmental assignments, mentoring system, upholding transparent and just career paths and others. However, it is arguable amongst the Muslim prominent scholars on matter for women becoming head of a country due to several reasons for women benefits. This position is also known as *al-Khalifah* or *al-Imam al-Kubra* or *al-Sultan al-A'zam*. They are the highest ruler or policy maker in the country under the caliphate system. It shows higher in power, authority and jurisdiction compared to other political and security positions. It is classified by Muslim scholars as 'Wilayah Ammah' and in opposite to this is classified as 'Wilayah Khassah'. These rulership positions are entrusted solely for men by majority of Muslim scholars. This is due to several arguments and factors (al-Mawardi, (n.d.), Muhammad b. Ali al-Shawkani (1961), Ibn Taimiyyah (1993).

For the 'Wilayah Khassah' where the authority is limited to certain areas or field of work, majority of Muslim scholars are in agreement for women to hold highest managerial ranking position (Sharifah Hayaati & Ilhaamie, 2009). According to Ibn Hazm, women are permitted to hold this position based on al-hadith narrated by Abu Bakrah (Ibn. Hazm, 1970) "Each of you is a leader and responsible to whom you lead" (al-Bukhari, 1986).

And with this rule, we settle to acknowledge that women's involvement in government or organizational leadership is permissible in Islam.

3. Methodology

3.1 Research Goal

In this study, the objective is to examine the facilitators and the barriers of Indonesian Muslim women public servants in their career advancement. Based on the literature review as mentioned above, a questionnaire was developed and later was tested on five women public managers (Cooper & Schindler, 2003). The final instrument contains 10 sections in 16 pages of the demography of the respondents, facilitators, organizational facilities and policies, attitudes towards work, barriers, critical success factors, career advancement from Islamic perspective, future plans and recommendations.

3.2 Sample and Data Collection

The questionnaires were distributed to three ministries in Jakarta, West Java and three ministries in Aceh, Sumatera by using convenience sampling technique. This technique was used as descriptive data is pertinent for an exploratory study. Moreover, it is very hard to collect data considering that the researchers are foreigners. This matter was observed while the pre-test was conducted by the researchers. These three ministries were chosen by based on the assumption that career advancement was harder for Muslim women due to the ministries' masculine characteristics (e.g. Ministry of International Trade). Meanwhile, Java and Sumatera specifically Jakarta and Aceh were chosen due to the fact that they are the main two places which contain high population of Muslim in Indonesia.

1.1. Results and Discussion

With the help of Indonesian research assistants, about 147 completed questionnaires were collected, however; unfortunately; only 33 were useable. This amounted to 22.45% rate of response.

Majority of the respondents are Acehnese (63.6%) aging from 46 to 58 years old (36.4%), married (72.7%) for 16 to 20 years (36.4%) with one to five children (63.6%). Their priority is their family (51.5%) and therefore, they are the primary provider of their family (69.7%). These Muslim women possess bachelor degree (53.8%) and thus, they hold professional and managerial post (84.8%) for one to five years (69.7%) and earn from 3,100,000 to 4 million rupiah (33.3%) with salary grade of IV/b (15.5%). Their parents possess tertiary education (54.5% & 42.4% respectively), however; their mothers are not working (72.7%). On the other hand, their fathers work in the private sector (18.2%).

Thus, the assumption that Indonesian women are not the primary provider in their family is not supported by this study. Moreover, majority of the respondents are new in their departments. This could be due to they keep being transferred from one department to other department. Please refer to table 2 for further details.

Table 2: Respondents' Profile

Factors	Majority	Percentage (%)
Ethnic	Aceh	63.6
Age	46-58 years old	36.4
Marital Status	Married	72.7
Length of Marriage	16-20 years	36.4
Qualification	Bachelor Degree	53.8
Basic Salary	3,100,000-4,000,000 Rupiah	33.3
Salary Grade	IV/b	15.5
Position	Professional & Managerial	84.8
Tenure	1-5 years	69.7
No. of Children	1-5	63.6
Total Hours of Household Duties	6-10 hours	39.4
First Priority	Family	51.5
Primary Provider	Yes	69.7
Fathers' Highest Education	Tertiary	54.5
Mothers' Highest Education	Tertiary	42.4
Fathers' Occupation	Private	18.2
Mothers' Occupation	Not Working	72.7

These women spent eight hours (51.5%) at work and they sometimes bring work back home (57.6%). This shows that women are hardworking. Majority of them prefer to work with anybody be it women or men as their boss (63.6%). Thus, they are satisfied with their position (60.6%), salary (51.5%) and power (72.7%). Please refer to table 3 for further details.

Table 3: Attitudes toward Work

Items	Majority	Percentage (%)
Hours Spent at Work	8 Hours	51.5
Bring Work Back Home	Sometimes	57.6
Position Satisfaction	Yes	60.6
Salary Satisfaction	Yes	51.5
Power Satisfaction	Yes	72.7

These women believed that some facilities are provided by their employer to ease the conflict of working with their families. Some of the facilities are child care (60.6%), job sharing (54.5%), flexible hours (45.5%), longer maternity leave (36.4%) and working from home (27.3%). Please refer to table 4 for further details.

Table 4: Current Facilities for Career Women

Recommendations	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Child Care	20	60.6
Job Sharing	18	54.5
Flexible Hours	15	45.5
Longer Maternity Leave	12	36.4
Work from home	9	27.3

Regarding the policies on career advancement, these women believe that women are treated with the same trust and confidence (51.2%), given the same assignments as men (48.5%), the rules treat them equally as men (45.5%), being paid comparable salaries (36.4%) and are not asked to relocate geographically (30.3%). Please refer to table 5 for further details.

Table 5: Policies on Career Advancement

Attitudes	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Women are treated with the same trust & confidence	17	51.2
Women are given the same assignments as men	16	48.5
The rules treat men & women equally	15	45.5
Women are paid comparable salaries	12	36.4
Women are not asked to relocate geographically	10	30.3

These women agreed that the factors that contribute to their career success were experience (39.4%), gender (36.4%), education (33.3%), seniority (30.3%), interpersonal skills and ability in tackling boss (27.3%), commitment and dedication (24.2%), support from boss, colleagues and family (24.2 %) and leadership styles (21.2%). Please refer to table 6 for further details.

Table 6: Critical Success Factors

Factors	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Experience	13	39.4
Gender	12	36.4
Education	11	33.3
Seniority	10	30.3
Interpersonal Skills	9	27.3
Ability in Tackling Boss	9	27.3
Commitment & Dedication	8	24.2
Support from Boss & Colleagues	8	24.2
Support from Family	8	24.2
Leadership Style	7	21.2

On the other hand, they believe that there are some factors that hinder them from career advancement which are preference for family (57.6%), limited access to professional training and personality (51.5%), lack of leadership charisma (48.5%), lack of confidence (45.5%), society expectation and gender bias (42.4%), lack of qualification,

power, experience and mentoring system (39.4%), low self esteem (36.4%), lack of informal network and not being taken seriously (30.3%) and lack of prestigious developmental assignments (27.3%). Please refer to table 7 for further details.

Table 7: Barriers of Career Advancement

Items	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Preference For Family	19	57.6
Limited Access to Professional Training	17	51.5
Personality	17	51.5
Lack of Leadership Charisma	16	48.5
Lack of Confidence	15	45.5
Society Expectation	14	42.4
Gender Bias	14	42.4
Lack of Qualification	13	39.4
Insufficient Experience	13	39.4
Lack of Power	13	39.4
No Mentoring System	13	39.4
Low Self Esteem	12	36.4
Lack of Informal Network	10	30.3
Not Being Taken Seriously	10	30.3
Lack of Prestigious Developmental Assignments	9	27.3

Regarding to their attitude towards career advancement, they believe that Muslim women are capable in leading organizations (60.6%) as physical inferiority compared to men is not a factor in their religion (54.5%). They should be obeyed and respected as men (51.5%) as their religion does not prohibit them to be the leader of the men (42.4%). This is due to gender is not a factor (33.3%) to be the leader but their capabilities are. Moreover, Muslim Indonesian female civil servants are more concerned of their staff (45.5%).

However, family is more important than their career (60.6%). Thus; these Indonesian Muslim civil servants believe that Muslim women should assist their family financially if the husbands are unemployed or terminally ill (42.4%). Please refer to table 8 for further details.

Table 8: Career Advancement of Muslim Women

Items	Frequency	Percentage
Muslim women are capable in leading organizations	20	60.6
Physical inferiority compared to men is not a factor	18	54.5
Muslim women leaders should be obeyed as men	17	51.5
Muslim women leaders should be respected as men	17	51.5
Muslim women can be leaders to men	14	42.4
Gender is not a factor	11	33.3

Majority agreed that they have good prospects for promotion in their departments (63.6%). Thus, they would apply promotion in the next three to five years in their department (69.7% & 21.2% respectively). In order to get the promotion, they are willing to devote their time to advance in their career (45.5%) such as to further studies and perform abilities (30.3%), attend courses (27.3%), develop network with management (24.2%) or change leadership style (18.2%). Majority of them also would like to adjust their career aspiration if they are unsuccessful in their career advancement (48.5%). However, only one of them would like to leave the organization (3.8%). Hence, only a small number of them would leave their organizations if they are unsuccessful in their career advancement. This definitely supports their satisfaction of their position, grade and salary. Please refer to table 9 for further details.

Table 9: Future Plans

Items	Frequency	Percentage
Apply promotion in next 3-5 years	23	69.7
Adjust career aspiration	16	48.5
Devote time to advance career	15	45.5
Further Studies	10	30.3
Perform Abilities	10	30.3
Attend Courses	9	27.3
Develop Network with Management	8	24.2
Seek Position At A Higher Level in the Department	7	21.2
Change Leadership Style	6	18.2
Leave the organization	1	3.8

4. Conclusion and Recommendations

The Indonesian public service has taken all measures to ensure that Muslim women are equally represented in decision making levels especially in terms of policies and facilities. Furthermore, the respondents show positive attitudes toward their career advancement even though they admitted that they are facing some barriers that could hinder their career progression. To them, in order to be successful in their career progression, experience tops the list of critical success factors. Thus, only one of the respondents is willing to leave the organizations if her career advancement does not materialize in 5 years time.

Hence, in order to obtain a large amount and valuable experience, these women have to ensure that they would not be transferred frequently from one department to another department as experience is crucial to their career advancement. Longer tenure in certain department means deeper knowledge and higher skills which are very important for career advancement.

Since facilities and policies have impacted positively on Muslim women career advancement, senior managers or administrators in Indonesian public service should enhance and improvise the existing facilities and policies. Effort should also be carried out to establish other facilities and policies that could trigger significant improvement for Muslim women career advancement. Nevertheless, barriers found in this study should also be tackled so that those women can accelerate their career advancement tremendously.

This article is limited to the three ministries in Indonesia and thus, the findings could not be generalized throughout the government. Hopefully, future research will be conducted to fill in the research gaps.

Acknowledgements

Special thanks to RG102/HNE09 for funding this research and to Abdul Rachman Hussein, Iskandar and Iqbal for collecting the data.

References

- Al-Bukhari, Sahih Bukhari (1986). Vol 13, No.7138.
- Al-Mawardi, (n.d), al-Ahkam al-Sultaniah, Beirut: Dar al Fikr.
- Al-Shawkani, Muhammad b. Ali (1961). Nayl al-atur Syarh al-Muntaqa al-Akhbar min Ahadith Sayyid al-Akhyar, Kaherah: Maktabah Mustafa al-Halabi, Vol.8.
- Anonymous. (n.d.), The politics of gender and decentralization in Indonesia, retrieved on Jan 20th, 2010 at <http://www.policy.hu/siahaan/researchpaper3.htm>.
- Asima Yanty Siahaan (1998), Women and decentralization in Indonesia: bringing local government closer to women? Retrieved on Jan 18th, 2010 at <http://www.policy.hu/siahaan/Policypaper1.htm>.
- Badan Pusat Statistik (BPS) (1999) Sakernas 1997-1998. Jakarta.
- Badan Pusat Statistik (BPS) (2008) Sakernas. Jakarta.
- Booth, Anne (2005) The evolving role of the central government in economic planning and policy making in Indonesia, *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies*, 41(2): 197-219.
- Ford, Michele, Lyn Parker (2008) Thinking about Indonesian women and work (eds) Women and Work in Indonesia. London: Routledge, 1-16
- Ibn Taimiyyah, (1993). al-siyasah al-syar'iyah fi islah al-Ra'i wa al-Ra'iyah, Beirut.

- Ibn. Hazm, (1970). al-Muhalla, Matba'ah al-Jumhuriyyah: Mesir, Vol.9
- International Labour Office (ILO) Labour Statistics (Laborsta) (<http://laborsta.ilo.org/>)
- UNDP Report (2009, March), Assessing gender responsive local capacity development in Indonesia, retrieved on October 29th, 2010 at http://www.thepowerofhow.org/uploads/resource/UNDP_Indonesia_Gender_Study_final_version_45.pdf.
- UNDP (2010), Women's participation in politics and government in Indonesia: a policy paper, retrieved on October 29th 2011 at <http://docs.google.com/viewer?a=v&q=cache:KxBvj9U2zwJ:www.parliamentproject.org/download.php%3Fid%3D188+women's+participation+in+politics+and+government+in+indonesia&hl=en&gl>.
- Azura Omar and Marilyn J. Davids (2001), Women in management: a comparative cross-cultural overview, *Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal*, 8 (¾): 35 – 67.
- Clarissa Adamson (2007), Gendered anxieties: Islam, women's rights, and moral hierarchy in Java, *Anthropological Quarterly*, Vol. 80, retrieved on Jan 19th, 2010 at <http://www.britannica.com/bps/additionalcontent/18/24442955/Gendered-Anxieties-Islam-Womens-Rights-and-Moral-Hierarchy-in-Java>.
- Cooper, D.R. & Schindler, P.S. (2003), *Business Research Methods*, New York: Irwin-McGraw Hill.
- Esposito, J. (2009, July), Muslim women reclaiming their rights, *The Washington Post*, retrieved on Jan 15th, 2010 at <http://ispu.org/articles/articledetailpb-84.html>.
- Ilhaamie, A.G.A., Sharifah Hayaati, S.I. and Siti Arni, B. Career advancement barriers in Malaysian federal public service, a special focus on Muslim women. Paper presented at the International Conference on Financial Management and Economics, 2-4 July 2011, Hong Kong.
- Ilhaamie, A.G.A., Sharifah Hayaati, S.I. and Siti Arni, B. Facilitators of women career advancement in public service: a study in a developing country. Paper presented at the International Conference on Innovation, Management and Service, September 2011, Singapore.
- Ilhaamie., Sharifah Hayaati, S.I. and Siti Arni, B. (2012), Facilitators of women career advancement in public service: a study in a developing country, *International Journal on Social Sciences and Humanities*, 2(1) [online].
- Indonesia Country Analysis Report, (2009, Sept.), retrieved on Jan 15th at http://www.asiasecuritiesforum.org/pdf/2009/indonesia_country_report.pdf.
- Isabel Dale Silver. (1998), In the shadow: women, gender, and public administration in Indonesia, Virginia Commonwealth University, retrieved on Feb 3rd, 2010 at <http://ips.illinois.edu/wggp/newsletter/apr99.html>.
- Lynne Bennington and Ahmad D. Habir (2003), Human resource management in Indonesia. *Human Resource Management Review*, 13 (3): 373-392, retrieved on Feb 3rd, 2010 at http://www.sciencedirect.com/science?_ob=ArticleURL&_udi=B6W4J-49F8VKG1&_user=152948&_coverDate=12%2F31%2F2003&_rdoc=1&_fmt=high&_orig=search&_sort=d&_docanchor=&view=c&_searchStrId=1191412935&_rerunOrigin=scholar.google&_acct=C000012678&_version=1&_urlVersion=0&_userid=152948&md5=c7f02aed253bfc6d65d73f4d6f76cb5#toc8.
- M. Van Klaveren, K.G. Tijdens, M. Hughie-Williams and N.E. Ramos (2010), An overview of women's work and employment in Indonesia, Decisions for Life MDG3 Project, Country Report No. 14, AIAS University of Amsterdam.
- Nisha Agrawal. (August 1996), *The Benefit of Growth for Indonesian Workers*, Issue 1637, World Bank Publication.
- Paramita Muljono (2007, Oct-Dec.), Glass ceiling in government: Women in the Ministry of Finance face significant obstacles to advancement, *Inside Indonesia*, 90, retrieved on Jan 14th, 2010 at <http://www.insideindonesia.org/content/view/1018/4/>
- Sen, P. (1998). Indonesian women at work IN *Gender and Power in Affluent Asia*. Krishna Sen & Maila Stivens, (eds) London and New York: Routledge. Retrieved on 30th July 2012.
- Sharifah Hayaati, S.I. and Ilhaamie, A.G.A. (2009), Women's leadership in Islam: a special reference to women's involvement in the Malaysian public sector, *Journal Excellence*, 1(1): 70-84.
- Schech, Susanne, Mochamad Mustafa (2010) *The Politics of Gender Mainstreaming Poverty Reduction: An Indonesian Case Study*, *Social Politics*, 17(1): 111-135
- The Asia Foundation and Asian Development, (2006, July), Indonesia country gender assessment, The Southeast Asia Regional Department, Regional and Sustainable Development Department, Asian Development Bank Manila: Philippines, retrieved on Jan 15th at www.adb.org/documents/indonesia-country-gender-assessment
- Tjiptoherijanto, Priyono. (1997), Migran Nakerwan, Makalah disampaikan pada serial diskusi yang ke VII dengan tema "Permasalahan Perempuan Pekerja Migran Indonesia". Jakarta, 5 March 1997
- T.O. Ihromi. (1995), *Kajian Wanita dalam Pembangunan: Yayasan Obor Indonesia*
- Wright, L. and Tellei, V.C. (1993), Women in management in Indonesia, *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 23(4): 19.